

SHEFFIELD CONSERVATION ADVISORY GROUP

Meeting held 20th September, 2016

<u>PRESENT:</u>	<u>Name</u>	<u>Organisation</u>
	Dr. Philip Booth (Chair)	Co-opted Member
	Mr. Tim Hale	Sheffield Chamber of
	Mr. Patrick Burns	Commerce
	Mr. Rod Flint	Co-opted Member
	Mr. Simon Geddye	Georgian Group
	Mr. Howard Greaves	Civic Trust
		Hallamshire Historic Buildings
	Mr. Graham Hague	Society
		Victorian Society/South
	Dr. Roger Harper	Yorkshire Industrial History
	Mr. Bob Hawkins	Society
		Ancient Monuments Society
	Dr. Jo Lintonbon	Council for the Protection of
	Mr. Bob Marshall	Rural England
	Dr. Jan Woudstra	University of Sheffield
		Royal Town Planning Institute
		Landscape Institute

.....

1. **APOLOGIES FOR ABSENCE**

Apologies for absence were received from Prof. Clyde Binfield (Twentieth Century Society), Mr. Rob Darrington (Royal Institute of Chartered Surveyors), Mr. Andrew Shepherd (Society for the Protection of Ancient Buildings) and Louise White (Civic Trust).

2. **MINUTES**

The minutes of the meeting held on 21st June, 2016, were approved as a correct record, subject to the substitution, in the apologies for absence of the words "Society for the Protection of Ancient Buildings" for the words "Society for the Protection of Rural England".

Arising therefrom, the Group (a) noted that:-

(i) the Chair (Dr. Booth) had not had further contact with the City Council about the possible appointment of Dr. Woudstra be appointed as a member of the Independent Tree Panel, following a letter from the Head of Planning in June last. He would pursue the matter further;

(ii) a local heritage action zone application, in respect of Castlegate, had been submitted to Historic England. The scheme had a wider brief than previous schemes, being area based rather than building specific and one project per territory, of which there four, would be selected;

(iii) (A) the proposed scheme for the provision of student flats on the site of Stokes Tiles was not going ahead, (B) action had been started regarding the

painting of the former Wharncliffe Fireclay Works and (C) the Webb Patent Sewer Gas Lamps, of which there were 20, would be repaired as part of the upgrade street works by Amey, at the close of their contract. A solution to the problem of how to light them was being sought and
(iv) the 'Council for the Protection of Rural England' was now the 'Campaign for the Protection of Rural England'.

3. CHAIR'S REPORT

The Chair reported that:-

(a) He had attended the meeting of the Sheffield Development and Design Panel on 23rd June last. One of the three schemes considered would probably be referred to the Group; and

(b) there had been a recent fire at Loxley Chapel. The building's security had been breached, but it was still salvageable and its owner sought to bring forward a scheme for its development.

The Group noted the information.

4. ACTING HEAD OF PLANNING'S REPORT

The Acting Head of Planning reported that:-

(a) Mr. Mike Hayden, had resigned from his post as the Head of Planning and Mr Nalin Seneviratne, the Director of Capital and Major Projects was the Acting Head of Planning;

(b) there would be a speaker at the next meeting, regarding the Local Plan;

(c) an application had been received from the University of Sheffield, for a certificate of immunity from listing, in respect of the Hounsfeld Quarter. The buildings

affected were not within a conservation area or listed and if the certificate was granted,

they could not be listed for 5 years; and

(d) a document had been received from the Gardens Trust, formerly the Association of

Gardens Trusts and the Garden History Society, regarding 'The Planning System in England and the Protection of Historic Parks and Gardens' which was available on the Gardens Trust's website.

The Group noted the information.

5. SHEFFIELD SUSTAINABLE DEVELOPMENT AND DESIGN PANEL

The Group noted that there was no scheduled meeting of the Sheffield Development and Design Panel.

6. HERITAGE ASSETS

The Group considered the following application for planning permission for development affecting Heritage Assets and made the observations stated:-

(1) Erection of mixed use development comprising a six-storey office (Use Class B1) and retail block (Use Classes A1/A2) with rooftop plant room, basement car park and service area, erection of a standalone food and beverage/retail unit (Use Classes A1, A3, A4 and A5) with enhanced public realm and associated works on land at junction of Pinstone Street, Wellington Street & Charter Square (Full application under Reg 3 - 1992) (Case number: 16/03328/RG3)

The Group observed that there were no contextual drawings to show the impact of the scheme, which made it difficult to assess. The Group welcomed the exclusion of the Pepperpot Building from the scheme. The Group felt that the very large building within the scheme was not on the same scale as the buildings beyond the Peace Gardens. The Group considered that it was not in a position to say, but it doubted that the building would form a satisfactory frontage with Cambridge Street, Pinstone Street and the Moor. The Group deferred making its final decision on the scheme, until the next meeting.

(2) Demolition of existing public house and hot food takeaway and erection of 16-storey student accommodation building comprising 38x cluster flats and 29x studio apartments, with associated cycle parking, landscaping and amenity space including games area, gym, cinema, library, common room and lounge area at ground and lower ground floor levels on the site of 82 - 84 Winter Street (Star and Garter). (Case number: 16/03264/FUL)

The Group felt that the development would create a building that would compete with the Arts Tower and would be very visible from distant points with key views and from entrances to the City. The Group considered that it would have a damaging impact on Weston Park and an adverse impact on nearby housing. The Group felt that the development would affect the setting of the former Winter Street Hospital, currently the University of Sheffield's Faculty of Law, which the Group considered to be a more appropriate height than the current proposal. The Group observed that the location was not appropriate for a cluster of towers and that the Arts Tower had been designed to be a unique feature in the landscape, which would be severely compromised if there was another tall building close by.

(3) Demolition of car showroom and associated buildings and erection of mixed use development comprising four blocks ranging from 6 to 11 storeys in height to provide 2,027sqm of retail floorspace, 136 residential apartments, 40 student cluster flats (190 student beds) with basement car parking, associated landscaping, bin stores, cycle parking and electricity

substation (Amended resubmission of previously refused application no. 15/01180/FUL) at 245 Ecclesall Road (Case number: 16/03159/FUL).

The Group affirmed its previous decision regarding the development.

(4) Erection of single-storey annex to chapel building (Phase 2) Attercliffe Chapel Attercliffe Common (Case Number: 16/03037/LBC)

The Group welcomed the re-use of the building as a church, which it considered to be a significant building. The Group felt that the construction of an extension would not be unacceptable but that, in its present form, the current proposal did not fully respect the character of the original building. The Group observed that a heritage assessment would be helpful to the consideration of the application and what would be appropriate development. The Group noted with regret that the developers had not followed the advice of the Head of Planning, regarding the development.

7. UPDATE REPORT

The Acting Head of Planning reported that:-

- (a) planning permission had been granted on 21st August, 2016 for the development of Heeley Bank School, to create 14 apartments;
- (b) a presentation on the Sheffield Retail Quarter would be made at the next meeting;
- (c) unauthorised action which had taken place at the former Manor Lodge School, since its conversion, would be investigated; and
- (d) the planning application for a development at Summerfield Street would be considered by the Planning Authority in the next few weeks. The Acting Director had recommended that approval be granted for the scheme, which was better than the approved scheme for the site and was subject to a legal agreement that work to open up the Porter Brook would be done.

8. MISCELLANEOUS ITEMS

Members reported on development affecting conservation areas and heritage assets and the Group noted that:-

- (a) Simon Geddye, Paul Bedwell and Louise White aimed to ensure that one of them would attend each meeting of the Group as the representative of the Civic Trust ;
- (b) the Civic Trust's Sheffield Design Awards Ceremony would take place at the former Head Post Office, Fitzalan Square, on 26th October next;
- (c) the entrance gates of Oakes Park had been restored satisfactorily;
- (d) Councillor Isobel Bowler, a champion of heritage issues, had recently died;
- (e) both the Upper Chapel, Norfolk Street and C hanning Hall had been open for the recent Heritage Open Days and 400 people had visited them;
- (f) the little Lodge, Portobello was being demolished;
- (g) work was being carried out at Provincial House, the former presbytery of St

Vincent's Church;

(h) it was possible that the barn of Cow Mouth Farm would be saved from demolition. New roof trusses had been installed on the property;

(i) there was a great deal of unauthorised advertising at Sheaf Quays;

(j) Emoji lights would be reflected onto the exteriors of Sheffield Cathedral and the City Hall for the Festival of the Mind, from 15th -26th September, next;

(k) the character of the tree population of the City would be affected by the work of Amey. For example, one third of the trees in the north east would be removed and would be replaced by much smaller species of tree. The climate required robust trees, but less robust trees were to be planted, in place of existing lime trees. Only local residents could vote on whether particular trees should be retained. Trees were being felled, not on the grounds that they were unhealthy, but because they were raising the kerb near them. It seemed that the only thing which mattered was the relevant contract. It would be helpful if a representative of Amey or the City Council attended a future meeting to discuss the specification of the relevant contract;

(l) there would be an event at St Mark's Church, Broomhill on 29th October, next about the life and work of George Pace, which had been organised by the Yorkshire Historic Churches Trust;

(m) roof trusses had been installed at the former horse hospital, Lady's Bridge; and

(n) the Sheffield Urban Design Week would commence on 24th October, next and the Sheffield Design Week would commence on 20th October, next.

.

(Note: These minutes are subject to amendment at a future meeting)

This page is intentionally left blank